

On the impossibility of a finite propositional lattice for quantum mechanics

Autor(en): **Ivert, P.-A. / Sjödin, T.**

Objektyp: **Article**

Zeitschrift: **Helvetica Physica Acta**

Band (Jahr): **51 (1978)**

Heft 5-6

PDF erstellt am: **25.09.2024**

Persistenter Link: <https://doi.org/10.5169/seals-114963>

Nutzungsbedingungen

Die ETH-Bibliothek ist Anbieterin der digitalisierten Zeitschriften. Sie besitzt keine Urheberrechte an den Inhalten der Zeitschriften. Die Rechte liegen in der Regel bei den Herausgebern.

Die auf der Plattform e-periodica veröffentlichten Dokumente stehen für nicht-kommerzielle Zwecke in Lehre und Forschung sowie für die private Nutzung frei zur Verfügung. Einzelne Dateien oder Ausdrucke aus diesem Angebot können zusammen mit diesen Nutzungsbedingungen und den korrekten Herkunftsbezeichnungen weitergegeben werden.

Das Veröffentlichen von Bildern in Print- und Online-Publikationen ist nur mit vorheriger Genehmigung der Rechteinhaber erlaubt. Die systematische Speicherung von Teilen des elektronischen Angebots auf anderen Servern bedarf ebenfalls des schriftlichen Einverständnisses der Rechteinhaber.

Haftungsausschluss

Alle Angaben erfolgen ohne Gewähr für Vollständigkeit oder Richtigkeit. Es wird keine Haftung übernommen für Schäden durch die Verwendung von Informationen aus diesem Online-Angebot oder durch das Fehlen von Informationen. Dies gilt auch für Inhalte Dritter, die über dieses Angebot zugänglich sind.

On the impossibility of a finite propositional lattice for quantum mechanics

by P.-A. Ivert and T. Sjödin¹⁾

Matematiska Institutionen, Universitetet, Linköping, Sweden

(17. IV. 1978)

Abstract. We give a simplified proof of the impossibility of defining an orthogonality relation in vector spaces (of dimension ≥ 3) over finite fields.

In a previous issue [1] of this journal, Eckmann and Zabey showed 'that the lattice of propositions of a quantum mechanical system cannot be represented as subspaces of Hilbert Space with coefficients from a finite field' (with exception of the dimension two), employing arguments from the theory of such fields and of quadratic forms. We here intend to show that this follows in a simple way already from the axiom system for lattices of subspaces of Hilbert spaces.

The axioms needed are:

- (1) L is a complete lattice with 0 and 1.
- (2) Atomicity: Every non-zero element in L majorizes an atom, i.e. a non-zero element $p \in L$ with $0 < x \leq p$ only if $x = p$.
- (3) Atomic covering property: If p is an atom, then $x \leq y \leq x \vee p$ only if $y = x$ or $y = x \vee p$.
- (4) Atomic bisection property (irreducibility): If p and q are atoms, $p \neq q$, then there exists an atom r with $r \neq p, r \neq q$ and $r \leq p \vee q$.
- (5) L is orthocomplemented: An orthocomplementation is an involutive mapping $L \ni x \mapsto x' \in L$, with $x \vee x' = 1$, $x \wedge x' = 0$ and $x \leq y$ iff $y' \leq x'$.
- (6) Orthomodularity: If $x \leq y$, then $y = x \vee (x' \wedge y)$.

It is known that if L is of dimension ≥ 4 there exist a division ring K with an involutorial anti-automorphism $\lambda \mapsto \lambda^*$ and a vector space E over K with a Hermitian form f such that L is ortho-isomorphic to the lattice $L_E(E)$ of E -closed subspaces of E [2].

We define the dimension of an element $x \in L$ as the minimum number of atoms p_i with $x = \bigvee_i p_i$. It follows from an elementary combinatorial argument [3] that every two-dimensional element majorizes the same number of atoms.

¹⁾ Present address: Philosophisches Seminar, Göttingen, BRD.

We will show that in an orthomodular lattice of dimension ≥ 3 this number cannot be finite. It is sufficient to prove this for three-dimensional lattices, i.e. lattices for which 1 is three-dimensional, since if the dimension is larger, we may pick a three-dimensional element x and consider the lattice of all elements of L majorized by x . In view of the orthomodularity, $y \mapsto x \wedge y'$ is an orthocomplementation on this lattice.

In the following we will consequently assume that L is a three-dimensional lattice satisfying axioms 1–5, where each two-dimensional element majorizes $n + 1$ atoms (as would be the case in a Hilbert space over a field of order n).

It follows from axioms 1–4 that the total number of atoms in L is $N = n^2 + n + 1$ [3].

We define the $N \times N$ -matrix $A = (a_{ij})_{1 \leq i, j \leq N}$ by

$$a_{ij} = \begin{cases} 1 & \text{if } e_i \text{ and } e_j \text{ are orthogonal, i.e. if } e_i \leq e'_j \\ 0 & \text{otherwise} \end{cases}$$

A is then a symmetric matrix with zeros in the diagonal, exactly $n + 1$ 1's in each row, and for any two rows there is exactly one column where both rows have a 1.

Consequently $A^2 = nE + U$ where E is the identity matrix of order N and every element of U is 1.

One easily finds that A^2 has the eigenvector $\begin{pmatrix} 1 \\ 1 \\ \vdots \\ 1 \end{pmatrix}$ with eigenvalue $n + N = (n + 1)^2$ and the orthogonal complement in R^N of this vector is an eigenspace of A with eigenvalue n . We conclude that A , apart from the eigenvalue $n + 1$, has eigenvalues $\varepsilon_1\sqrt{n}, \varepsilon_2\sqrt{n}, \dots, \varepsilon_{N-1}\sqrt{n}$, where $\varepsilon_i = \pm 1$.

Since the trace of A (i.e. the sum of the diagonal elements) equals the sum of its eigenvalues, we obtain: $n + 1 + m\sqrt{n} = 0$, where $m = \sum_{i=1}^{N-1} \varepsilon_i$ is an integer. Clearly $m \neq 0$, so $\sqrt{n} = -(n + 1)/m$ is a rational number, that is an integer, since the square root of an integer is either irrational or an integer. Setting $\sqrt{n} = k$ gives:

$$m = -\frac{k^2 + 1}{k} = -\left(k + \frac{1}{k}\right), \quad \frac{1}{k} = -(m + k).$$

But this means that $1/k$ is an integer, and we get our desired contradiction, since axiom 4 implies $n \geq 2$.

We have thus shown that there exist no 'Hilbert lattices' of dimension ≥ 3 with a finite number of atoms under each two-dimensional element, from which the non-existence of Hilbert spaces of dimension ≥ 3 over finite fields follows.

REFERENCES

- [1] J.-P. ECKMANN and PH. CH. ZABEY, 'Impossibility of Quantum Mechanics in a Hilbert Space over a Finite Field', *Helv. Phys. Acta* 42, 420–424 (1969).
- [2] F. MAEDA and S. MAEDA, *Theory of Symmetric Lattices* (Springer-Verlag, 1970).
- [3] G. BIRKHOFF, *Lattice Theory*, 2nd ed. American Mathematical Society Colloquium Publications (1948).