

**Zeitschrift:** L'Enseignement Mathématique  
**Herausgeber:** Commission Internationale de l'Enseignement Mathématique  
**Band:** 54 (2008)  
**Heft:** 1-2

**Artikel:** Putative relation gaps  
**Autor:** Bridson, Martin R. / Tweeddale, Michael  
**DOI:** <https://doi.org/10.5169/seals-109884>

### **Nutzungsbedingungen**

Die ETH-Bibliothek ist die Anbieterin der digitalisierten Zeitschriften auf E-Periodica. Sie besitzt keine Urheberrechte an den Zeitschriften und ist nicht verantwortlich für deren Inhalte. Die Rechte liegen in der Regel bei den Herausgebern beziehungsweise den externen Rechteinhabern. Das Veröffentlichen von Bildern in Print- und Online-Publikationen sowie auf Social Media-Kanälen oder Webseiten ist nur mit vorheriger Genehmigung der Rechteinhaber erlaubt. [Mehr erfahren](#)

### **Conditions d'utilisation**

L'ETH Library est le fournisseur des revues numérisées. Elle ne détient aucun droit d'auteur sur les revues et n'est pas responsable de leur contenu. En règle générale, les droits sont détenus par les éditeurs ou les détenteurs de droits externes. La reproduction d'images dans des publications imprimées ou en ligne ainsi que sur des canaux de médias sociaux ou des sites web n'est autorisée qu'avec l'accord préalable des détenteurs des droits. [En savoir plus](#)

### **Terms of use**

The ETH Library is the provider of the digitised journals. It does not own any copyrights to the journals and is not responsible for their content. The rights usually lie with the publishers or the external rights holders. Publishing images in print and online publications, as well as on social media channels or websites, is only permitted with the prior consent of the rights holders. [Find out more](#)

**Download PDF:** 06.08.2025

**ETH-Bibliothek Zürich, E-Periodica, <https://www.e-periodica.ch>**

# 15

## PUTATIVE RELATION GAPS

by Martin R. BRIDSON and Michael TWEEDALE

Given  $\Gamma = \langle \mathcal{A} \mid \mathcal{R} \rangle$ , the action of the free group  $F(\mathcal{A})$  by conjugation on  $R = \langle\langle \mathcal{R} \rangle\rangle$  induces an action of  $\Gamma$  on the abelian group  $M = R/[R, R]$ . It is obvious that the rank of  $M$  as a  $\mathbb{Z}\Gamma$ -module serves as a lower bound on the minimal number of relators that one requires to present  $\Gamma$  on the generators  $\mathcal{A}$ . This lower bound seems so crude that one cannot imagine it would be sharp in general. And yet, despite sustained attack over many years, not a single example has been established to lend substance to this intuition. The question of whether or not there exists such an example has become known as the *relation gap problem*.

The problem has its origins in the early work of Karl Gruenberg and others on relation modules in the 1960s and 1970s; it first seems to have appeared in print in [5] and occurs twice in different guises in Wall's famous problem list [10], though the name does not enter the literature until 1993 [7]. It belongs to a circle of notoriously hard problems concerning the homotopy properties of finite 2-complexes — the Andrews–Curtis conjecture, Whitehead's asphericity conjecture, the Eilenberg–Ganea conjecture, and the question (resolved by M. Bestvina and N. Brady [1]) of finite presentability versus  $\text{FP}_2$ .

To clarify our convictions regarding the relation gap problem we state

**CONJECTURE 15.1.** *There exist finite group presentations with arbitrarily large relation gaps.*

This conjecture is closely related to the  $D(2)$  conjecture: if a group  $\Gamma$  with  $H^3(\Gamma; \mathbb{Z}\Gamma) = 0$  admits a presentation that both realizes the group's deficiency and has a relation gap, then the  $D(2)$  conjecture is false, i.e. there exists a finite 3-complex that looks homologically like a 2-complex, in the sense that it possesses Wall's property  $D(2)$ , but that does not have the homotopy type

of a finite 2-complex. (This result is due to M. Dyer; a published proof can be found in J. Harlander's survey article [8].)

In the remainder of this note, we'll describe two families of groups and indicate why we think that they ought to have relation gaps, making explicit conjectures to that effect. The two families are of a very different nature: the first consists of groups with finite classifying spaces, based on the Bestvina–Brady construction; the second is comprised of virtually free groups and it is the nature of the torsion that dictates the key features of the relation module that we believe lead to a relation gap.

#### CYCLIC COVERINGS AND RIGHT-ANGLED ARTIN GROUPS

Let  $\Sigma$  be a connected flag complex with non-trivial, perfect fundamental group, and let  $G$  be the associated right-angled Artin group. This group has a presentation with generating set the vertices  $v_i$  of  $\Sigma$ , and defining relations asserting that two generators commute if and only if the corresponding vertices in  $\Sigma$  are joined by an edge. Let  $\pi: G \rightarrow \mathbf{Z}$  be the homomorphism sending each  $v_i$  to a fixed generator. The kernel of  $\pi$  is the *Bestvina–Brady group*  $H_\Sigma$ , which is  $\text{FP}_2$  but not finitely presented [1].

Let  $\Gamma_n \subset G$  be the index  $n$  subgroup  $\pi^{-1}(n\mathbf{Z})$ . Notice that  $H_\Sigma$  is the intersection of the  $\Gamma_n$ . We construct in [2] a presentation for  $\Gamma_n$  where the generators  $S_n$  are indexed by the vertices of  $\Sigma$  and the  $\mathbf{Z}\Gamma$ -rank of the relation module is bounded independently of  $n$ .

**CONJECTURE 15.2.** *The number of relators needed to present  $\Gamma_n$  on the generators  $S_n$  goes to infinity as  $n \rightarrow \infty$ , so  $\Gamma_n$  has a relation gap for  $n$  sufficiently large.*

#### SOME VIRTUALLY FREE EXAMPLES

We consider groups similar in spirit to ones considered by D. Epstein [4], C. Hog–Angeloni, W. Metzler and M. Lustig [9], and more recently by K. Gruenberg and P. Linnell [6].

Given letters  $x_m$  and  $t_m$ , let  $\rho_m$  be the word

$$\rho_m = (t_m x_m t_m^{-1}) x_m (t_m x_m^{-1} t_m^{-1}) x_m^{-m}.$$

We look at the groups  $\Gamma_{m,n} = Q_m * Q_n$ , where

$$Q_m = \langle x_m, t_m \mid \rho_m, x_m^{m-1} \rangle$$

and  $(m^{m-1} - 1)$  and  $(n^{n-1} - 1)$  are coprime.

One of the main attractions we see in these new examples is that one can give a short, transparent and natural proof [3] that the relation module of the obvious presentation of  $\Gamma_{m,n}$  can be generated by three elements, namely the images of  $\rho_m$ ,  $\rho_n$  and  $x_m^{m-1}x_n^{n-1}$ .

The groups  $\Gamma = \Gamma_{m,n}$  are virtually free, so  $H^3(\Gamma; \mathbf{Z}\Gamma) = 0$ . Thus one could find both a relation gap and a counterexample to the  $D(2)$  conjecture simply by solving the following concrete problem:

CONJECTURE 15.3. *The kernel of the map  $F_4 \rightarrow \Gamma$  associated to the presentation*

$$\Gamma = \langle x_m, t_m, x_n, t_n \mid \rho_m, x_m^{m-1}, \rho_n, x_n^{n-1} \rangle$$

*is not the normal closure of three elements.*

## REFERENCES

- [1] BESTVINA, M. and N. BRADY. Morse theory and finiteness properties of groups. *Invent. Math.* 129 (1997), 445–470.
- [2] BRIDSON, M.R. and M. TWEEDALE. Constructing presentations of subgroups of right-angled Artin groups. Preprint arXiv: math.GR/0709.0690 (2007).
- [3] BRIDSON, M.R. and M. TWEEDALE. Deficiency and abelianized deficiency of some virtually-free groups. *Math. Proc. Cambridge Philos. Soc.* 143 (2007), 257–264.
- [4] EPSTEIN, D.B.A. Finite presentations of groups and 3-manifolds. *Quart. J. Math., Oxford Ser. (2)* 12 (1961), 205–212.
- [5] GRUENBERG, K. *Relation Modules of Finite Groups*. CBMS Regional Conference Series in Mathematics 25. Amer. Math. Soc., 1976.
- [6] GRUENBERG, K. and P. LINNELL. Generation gaps and abelianised defects of free products. Preprint arXiv: math.GR/0701225 (2007). To appear in *J. Group Theory*.
- [7] HARLANDER, J. Solvable groups with cyclic relation module. *J. Pure Appl. Algebra* 90 (1993), 189–198.
- [8] ———. Some aspects of efficiency. In: *Groups–Korea '98: Proceedings of the 4th International Conference on Theory of Groups Held at Pusan National Univ., Pusan, Korea*. Walter de Gruyter, 2000, 165–180.
- [9] HOG, C., M. LUSTIG and W. METZLER. Presentation classes, 3-manifolds and free products. In: *Geometry and Topology (College Park, Md., 1983/84)*. Lecture Notes in Mathematics 1167. Springer-Verlag, 1985, 154–167.

- [10] WALL, C. T. C. (ed.). List of problems. In: *Homological Group Theory (Proc. Sympos., Durham, 1977)*. London Math. Soc. Lecture Note Ser. 36. Cambridge Univ. Press, 1979, 369–394.

Martin R. Bridson

Department of Mathematics  
Imperial College  
London SW7 2AZ  
United Kingdom  
*e-mail*: m.bridson@imperial.ac.uk

Michael Tweedale

Department of Mathematics  
University of Bristol  
Bristol BS8 1TW  
United Kingdom  
*e-mail*: m.tweedale@bristol.ac.uk

Current address:

Mathematical Institute  
24–29 St Giles'  
Oxford OX1 3LB  
United Kingdom  
*e-mail*: bridson@maths.ox.ac.uk