

Zeitschrift: L'Enseignement Mathématique
Herausgeber: Commission Internationale de l'Enseignement Mathématique
Band: 48 (2002)
Heft: 3-4: L'ENSEIGNEMENT MATHÉMATIQUE

Artikel: AN HOMOLOGY 4-SPHERE GROUP WITH NEGATIVE DEFICIENCY
Autor: HILLMAN, Jonathan A.
Rubrik
DOI: <https://doi.org/10.5169/seals-66076>

Nutzungsbedingungen

Die ETH-Bibliothek ist die Anbieterin der digitalisierten Zeitschriften auf E-Periodica. Sie besitzt keine Urheberrechte an den Zeitschriften und ist nicht verantwortlich für deren Inhalte. Die Rechte liegen in der Regel bei den Herausgebern beziehungsweise den externen Rechteinhabern. Das Veröffentlichen von Bildern in Print- und Online-Publikationen sowie auf Social Media-Kanälen oder Webseiten ist nur mit vorheriger Genehmigung der Rechteinhaber erlaubt. [Mehr erfahren](#)

Conditions d'utilisation

L'ETH Library est le fournisseur des revues numérisées. Elle ne détient aucun droit d'auteur sur les revues et n'est pas responsable de leur contenu. En règle générale, les droits sont détenus par les éditeurs ou les détenteurs de droits externes. La reproduction d'images dans des publications imprimées ou en ligne ainsi que sur des canaux de médias sociaux ou des sites web n'est autorisée qu'avec l'accord préalable des détenteurs des droits. [En savoir plus](#)

Terms of use

The ETH Library is the provider of the digitised journals. It does not own any copyrights to the journals and is not responsible for their content. The rights usually lie with the publishers or the external rights holders. Publishing images in print and online publications, as well as on social media channels or websites, is only permitted with the prior consent of the rights holders. [Find out more](#)

Download PDF: 16.04.2026

ETH-Bibliothek Zürich, E-Periodica, <https://www.e-periodica.ch>

We shall give an example of an homology 4-sphere whose group has deficiency < 0 . Thus none of the implications “ G is an homology 3-sphere group” \Rightarrow “ G is finitely presentable, perfect and $\text{def}(G) = 0$ ” \Rightarrow “ G is an homology 4-sphere group” \Rightarrow “ G is finitely presentable and superperfect” can be reversed.

A similar outcome was known for knots by the late 1970s. (Namely, none of the implications “ G is a 1-knot group” \Rightarrow “ G is a high dimensional knot group and $\text{def}(G) = 1$ ” \Rightarrow “ G is a 2-knot group” \Rightarrow “ G is a high dimensional knot group” can be reversed [Fo62, Ke65, Fa75]). The issue considered here was raised by Plotnick, who suggested a possible example [Pl82]. (See also [Be02]). We use a related construction, but our example is different, and we do not know whether Plotnick’s candidates indeed have negative deficiency.

The construction starts with a 2-knot $K: S^2 \rightarrow S^4$ and an homology 4-sphere Σ . Let M be the closed 4-manifold obtained by surgery on K , and let $N = M \sharp \Sigma$. Let $G = \pi_1(M)$ and $H = \pi_1(\Sigma)$. (Thus G is the group of the knot K .) Let $t \in G$ represent a generator of $G/G' \cong \mathbf{Z}$, and let $h \in H$. The conjugacy class of $th^{-1} \in \pi_1(N) \cong G * H$ is represented by an unique isotopy class of embeddings of S^1 in N . Surgery on such an embedding gives an homology 4-sphere P , with group $\pi = \pi_1(P) = (G * H) / \langle\langle th^{-1} \rangle\rangle$.

Let $\rho = \langle\langle G' \rangle\rangle_\pi$ be the normal closure of the image of G' in π . Then $\pi/\rho \cong H$, and so π is the semidirect product $\rho \rtimes H$. Let $\Gamma = \mathbf{Z}[H]$ and let $I = \text{Ker}(\varepsilon: \Gamma \rightarrow \mathbf{Z})$ be the augmentation ideal of H . Since H is finitely presentable I has a resolution C_* by free left Γ -modules which are finitely generated in degrees ≤ 2 . Let $B = H_1(\pi; \Gamma) \cong \rho/\rho'$. Then B is a left Γ -module and there is an exact sequence $0 \rightarrow B \rightarrow A \rightarrow I \rightarrow 0$, in which $A = H_1(\pi, 1; \Gamma)$ is a relative homology group [Cr61]. Evaluating the Jacobian matrix associated to a presentation for π via the natural epimorphism from $\mathbf{Z}[\pi]$ to Γ gives a presentation matrix for A as a module (see [Cr61] or [Fo62]). Thus there is an exact sequence $D_*: \dots \rightarrow \Gamma^m \rightarrow \Gamma^n \rightarrow A \rightarrow 0$, where $n - m = \text{def}(\pi)$. A mapping cone construction leads to an exact sequence of the form $C_2 \oplus D_1 \rightarrow C_1 \oplus D_0 \rightarrow B \oplus C_0 \rightarrow 0$ and hence to a presentation for B of the form $C_2 \oplus D_1 \oplus C_0 \rightarrow C_1 \oplus D_0 \rightarrow B$.

Now let K be the 2-twist spin of the trefoil knot, with group $G = \langle x, s \mid x^3 = 1, sxs^{-1} = x^{-1} \rangle$, and let H be the Higman group with presentation $\langle a, b, c, d \mid bab^{-1} = a^2, cbc^{-1} = b^2, dcd^{-1} = c^2, ada^{-1} = d^2 \rangle$. Then H is perfect and $\text{def}(H) = 0$, so there is an homology 4-sphere Σ with group H . Moreover H has cohomological dimension 2 [DV73], and so

there is a short exact sequence $0 \rightarrow \Gamma^4 \rightarrow \Gamma^4 \rightarrow I \rightarrow 0$. Let $t = s$ and $h = a$. Then $\pi = (G * H) / \langle\langle sa^{-1} \rangle\rangle$ has a presentation of deficiency -1 , and $B \cong \Gamma / \Gamma(3, a + 1)$. Since $B \cong \Gamma \otimes_{\Lambda} (\Lambda / \Lambda(3, a + 1))$, where $\Lambda = \mathbf{Z}[a, a^{-1}]$, there is an exact sequence

$$0 \rightarrow \Gamma \xrightarrow{(3, a+1)} \Gamma^2 \xrightarrow{\begin{pmatrix} a+1 \\ -3 \end{pmatrix}} \Gamma \rightarrow B \rightarrow 0.$$

Suppose that π has deficiency 0. Then B has deficiency 0 as a left Γ -module, by the general argument above. Hence there is an exact sequence

$$0 \rightarrow L \rightarrow \Gamma^p \rightarrow \Gamma^p \rightarrow B \rightarrow 0.$$

Schanuel's Lemma gives an isomorphism $\Gamma^{1+p+1} \cong L \oplus \Gamma^{p+2}$, on comparing these two resolutions of B . The endomorphism of Γ^{p+2} given by projection onto the second summand is an automorphism, by a theorem of Kaplansky (see page 122 of [Ka69]). Hence $L = 0$ and so B has a short free resolution. In particular, $\text{Tor}_2^{\Gamma}(R, B) = 0$ for any right Γ -module R . But it is easily verified that if $\bar{B} \cong \Gamma / (3, a + 1)\Gamma$ is the conjugate right Γ -module then $\text{Tor}_2^{\Gamma}(\bar{B}, B) \neq 0$. Thus our assumption was wrong, and $\text{def}(\pi) = -1 < 0$.

The group of the 2-twist spin of the trefoil knot is the simplest 2-knot group with deficiency 0 [Fo62]. Levine showed that the group of the sum of r copies of this knot has deficiency $1 - r$ [Le78]. If we use this sum in our construction above π now has a presentation of deficiency $-r$ and $B \cong (\Gamma / \Gamma(3, a + 1))^r$, so there is an exact sequence

$$0 \rightarrow \Gamma^r \rightarrow \Gamma^{2r} \rightarrow \Gamma^r \rightarrow B \rightarrow 0.$$

Is $\text{def}(\pi) = -r$?

Is there a *finite* homology 4-sphere group of negative deficiency? Our example above is "very infinite" in the sense that the Higman group H has no finite quotients, and therefore no finite-dimensional representations over any field [Hi51]. The simplest candidate to consider is perhaps the semidirect product of $\text{SL}(2, \mathbf{F}_5)$ with the normal subgroup \mathbf{F}_5^2 , and with the natural action of $\text{SL}(2, \mathbf{F}_5)$ on \mathbf{F}_5^2 . (This semidirect product has a presentation with 3 generators and 5 relations, is superperfect, and has order 3000. I do not know whether it is the group of an homology 4-sphere, nor whether it has deficiency 0.)