

**Zeitschrift:** L'Enseignement Mathématique  
**Herausgeber:** Commission Internationale de l'Enseignement Mathématique  
**Band:** 30 (1984)  
**Heft:** 1-2: L'ENSEIGNEMENT MATHÉMATIQUE

**Artikel:** TRIPLY UNIVERSAL ENTIRE FUNCTION  
**Autor:** Blair, Charles / Rubel, Lee  
**DOI:** <https://doi.org/10.5169/seals-53830>

### **Nutzungsbedingungen**

Die ETH-Bibliothek ist die Anbieterin der digitalisierten Zeitschriften auf E-Periodica. Sie besitzt keine Urheberrechte an den Zeitschriften und ist nicht verantwortlich für deren Inhalte. Die Rechte liegen in der Regel bei den Herausgebern beziehungsweise den externen Rechteinhabern. Das Veröffentlichen von Bildern in Print- und Online-Publikationen sowie auf Social Media-Kanälen oder Webseiten ist nur mit vorheriger Genehmigung der Rechteinhaber erlaubt. [Mehr erfahren](#)

### **Conditions d'utilisation**

L'ETH Library est le fournisseur des revues numérisées. Elle ne détient aucun droit d'auteur sur les revues et n'est pas responsable de leur contenu. En règle générale, les droits sont détenus par les éditeurs ou les détenteurs de droits externes. La reproduction d'images dans des publications imprimées ou en ligne ainsi que sur des canaux de médias sociaux ou des sites web n'est autorisée qu'avec l'accord préalable des détenteurs des droits. [En savoir plus](#)

### **Terms of use**

The ETH Library is the provider of the digitised journals. It does not own any copyrights to the journals and is not responsible for their content. The rights usually lie with the publishers or the external rights holders. Publishing images in print and online publications, as well as on social media channels or websites, is only permitted with the prior consent of the rights holders. [Find out more](#)

**Download PDF:** 07.12.2025

**ETH-Bibliothek Zürich, E-Periodica, <https://www.e-periodica.ch>**

## A TRIPLY UNIVERSAL ENTIRE FUNCTION

by Charles BLAIR and Lee RUBEL

*Dedicated to the Memory of Ernst Straus*

It is an interesting and amusing fact that there exist entire functions  $f$  of one complex variable that are universal in the sense that by applying simple analytical operations to  $f$ , and then taking limits, one can arrive at any entire function whatsoever. Let us consider four possible ways of making this precise:

- (a) the set of derivatives  $f^{(n)}$ ,  $n = 0, 1, 2, \dots$  is dense,
- (b) the set of positive integer translates  $f_n$ ,  $n = 0, 1, 2, \dots$  is dense,
- (c) a set of iterated integrals  $f^{(-n)}$ ,  $n = 0, 1, 2, \dots$  is dense,
- (d) the set of finite linear combinations of iterates  $f^{[n]}$ ,  $n = 1, 2, 3, \dots$  is dense.

Here, "dense" means "dense in the space of all entire functions in the topology of uniform convergence on compact sets". The translate  $f_\tau$  of  $f$  by a complex number  $\tau$  is defined by  $f_\tau(z) = f(z - \tau)$ . By an ( $n$ -fold) iterated integral  $f^{(-n)}$  of  $f$ , we mean a function  $F$  such that the  $n$ -th derivative  $F^{(n)} = f$ . For (c), it is clear that some non-trivial choice of the constants of integration must be made—if they were all 0, then the integrals would all vanish at the origin. For iterates,

$$f^{[1]} = f \quad \text{and} \quad f^{[n+1]}(z) = f(f^{[n]}(z)).$$

We will give a brief resumé of the history of this topic. In [GRM], Gerald MacLane produced an entire function universal in sense (a). His construction was unwittingly rederived by the authors in [BLR]. In [BIR], Birkhoff found an entire function universal in sense (b). Seidel and Walsh later used another construction in [SEW]. So far as we know, no one has previously considered condition (c). There are two related papers by Wolfgang Luh (see [LUH, I] and [LUH, II]). We shall give a simple proof that there does not exist any entire function  $f$  that is universal in sense (d).

The main purpose of this paper is to produce a single entire function  $f$  that is universal in all three of the senses (a), (b), and (c) at the same time. The mathematics involved is not difficult—just the analyst's usual tools (especially Runge's theorem (see [SAZ]))—but the existence of such an  $f$  is an entertaining fact, and working through the proofs has real pedagogical value. It is the second author's experience that students find these results attractive and somewhat paradoxical. We now prove that there exists a triply universal entire function  $f$ .

LEMMA. *Given two disjoint closed discs  $A$  and  $B$  and an entire function  $f$ , and  $\varepsilon > 0$  and a positive integer  $n$ , there exists a polynomial  $P$  such that*

$$\begin{aligned} |P(z) - f(z)| &\leq \varepsilon, & z \in B, \\ |P^{(j)}(z)| &\leq \varepsilon, & z \in A, \quad j = 0, 1, \dots, n. \end{aligned}$$

*Proof.* (A simple application of Runge's theorem.) Let  $A'$  be a closed disc concentric with  $A$ , with  $\text{radius}(A') = \delta + \text{radius}(A)$ , say,  $0 < \delta < 1$ , such that  $A' \cap B = \emptyset$ . Take  $\eta > 0$  to be chosen later, and use Runge's theorem to find a polynomial  $P$  such that

$$\begin{aligned} |P(z) - f(z)| &\leq \varepsilon & \text{for } z \in B, \\ |P(z)| &\leq \eta & \text{for } z \in A'. \end{aligned}$$

Then for  $z \in A$  and  $j = 0, 1, \dots, n$ ,

$$\begin{aligned} |P^{(j)}(z)| &= \left| \frac{j!}{2\pi i} \int_{\zeta \in \partial A'} \frac{P(\zeta)}{(\zeta - z)^{j+1}} d\zeta \right| \\ &\leq \frac{n!}{\delta^{n+1}} (\text{radius}(A')) \eta, \end{aligned}$$

and we may choose  $\eta$  so small that this last expression is less than  $\varepsilon$ .

Now we construct our function  $f$ . We begin with a function  $U(z)$  which is universal in sense (a). Let  $h_j$ ,  $j = 1, 2, \dots$  be a dense sequence of entire functions (e.g. the polynomials with rational coefficients, in some enumeration). We construct inductively polynomials  $P_j$ , closed discs  $A_j$ ,  $B_j$ , and natural numbers  $n_j$ . The desired  $f$  will be  $f(z) = U(z) + \sum_{j=1}^{\infty} P_j(z)$ .

The choice of  $P_1$ ,  $A_1$ ,  $B_1$ ,  $n_1$  is not important. We may take  $P_1(z) = z$ ,  $A_1 = \{z : |z| \leq 1\}$ ,  $B_1 = \{z : |z - 4| \leq 1\}$ , and  $n_1 = 1$ .

Next we specify the induction step. The disc  $A_{M+1}$  contains  $A_j, B_j$  for  $1 \leq j \leq M$ , and also contains  $\{z: |z| \leq M+1\}$ . The disc  $B_{M+1}$  is disjoint from  $A_{M+1}$  and has radius  $M+1$ . Let  $d_M$  be the maximum of the degrees of  $P_1, \dots, P_M$ . Choose  $n_{M+1} > n_M$  so that for each  $i$  with  $1 \leq i \leq M+1$ , there is a  $j$  with  $d_M < j \leq n_{M+1}$  such that  $|U^{(j)}(z) - h_i(z)| \leq 2^{-(M+1)}$  for  $|z| \leq M+1$ . We use the lemma to obtain  $P_{M+1}$  satisfying

$$|h_{M+1}(z-\alpha) - [U(z) + \sum_{j=1}^{M+1} P_j(z)]| < 2^{-(M+1)} \quad \text{for } z \in B_{M+1},$$

where  $\alpha$  is the center of  $B_{M+1}$ , and

$$|P_{M+1}^{(j)}(z)| \leq 2^{-(M+1)} \quad \text{for } z \in A_{M+1}, 0 \leq j \leq n_{M+1}.$$

This completes the construction of the  $P_j$  and the definition of  $f$ . Since  $\sum_{j=M}^{\infty} |P_j(z)| \leq 2^{-M+1}$  for  $|z| \leq M$ ,  $f$  is indeed an entire function.

If  $1 \leq i \leq M$ , then there exists a  $j$  with  $d_M < j \leq n_{M+1}$  with  $|U^{(j)}(z) - h_i(z)| \leq 2^{-(M+1)}$  for  $|z| \leq M+1$ , so that for  $|z| \leq M$ ,

$$\begin{aligned} |f^{(j)}(z) - h_i(z)| &= |U^{(j)}(z) + \sum_{l=M+1}^{\infty} P_l^{(j)}(z) - h_i(z)| \\ &\leq 2^{-(M+1)} + \sum_{l=M+1}^{\infty} 2^{-l}. \end{aligned}$$

This establishes that the derivatives of  $f$  are dense.

Finally, if  $|z| \leq M$  and  $\alpha$  is the center of  $B_M$ , then

$$\begin{aligned} |f(z+\alpha) - h_M(z)| &\leq |U(z+\alpha) + \sum_{j=1}^M P_j(z+\alpha) - h_M(z)| \\ &\quad + \sum_{j=M+1}^{\infty} |P_j(z+\alpha)| \leq 2^{-M} + \sum_{j=M+1}^{\infty} 2^{-j}, \end{aligned}$$

so that the translates of  $f$  are dense also.

The next proposition completes the proof that  $f$  is triply universal. First, a definition and a lemma:

*Notation.* Let  $f$  be an entire function. Define  $I^0 f = f$  and  $(I^{n+1} f)(z)$

$$= \int_0^z (I^n f)(w) dw.$$

LEMMA. For any entire  $f$  and any  $k > 0$ ,

$$\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \left( \sup_{|z| \leq k} |(I^n f)(z)| \right) = 0.$$

The proof is quite easy—see [BLR].

PROPOSITION. There exist constants  $C_1, C_2, C_3, \dots$  such that, for any entire function  $f$ , if we define the functions  $Q_k$  by

$$\begin{aligned} Q_0(z) &= f(z), \\ Q_1(z) &= (I^1 f)(z) + C_1, \\ Q_2(z) &= (I^2 f)(z) + C_1 z + C_2, \\ &\vdots \\ Q_k(z) &= (I^k f)(z) + \sum_{j=0}^k \frac{1}{j!} C_{k-j} z^j, \end{aligned}$$

then the sequence  $(Q_k)$  is dense.

*Proof of Proposition.* Let  $h_i(z)$ ,  $i = 1, 2, \dots$  be a dense sequence of polynomials. We construct the  $C_i$  in steps. At step  $n$  we have constructed  $C_1, C_2, \dots, C_{L_n}$ . For notational convenience we will write  $C_0 = 0$ .

Step 1:  $L_1 = 1$  and  $C_1 = 0$ .

Step  $n + 1$ : Let  $g(z) = g_n(z) = \sum_{j=0}^{L_n} \frac{1}{j!} C_{L_n-j} z^j$ .

Choose  $M > 0$  so that if  $k \geq M$  then  $|(I^k g)(z)| \leq \frac{1}{n+1}$  for all  $|z| \leq n+1$ . This is possible by the lemma. Let  $L_{n+1} = L_n + M + 1 + d_{n+1}$ , where  $d_{n+1}$  is the degree of  $h_{n+1}$ . Choose  $C_{L_{n+1}}, \dots, C_{L_{n+1}}$  so that

$$(*) \quad Q_{L_{n+1}}(z) = (I^{L_{n+1}} f)(z) + (I^{L_{n+1}-L_n} g)(z) + h_{n+1}(z).$$

To see that this is possible, note that

$$(I^{L_{n+1}-L_n} g)(z) = \sum_{j=L_{n+1}-L_n}^{L_{n+1}} \frac{1}{j!} C_{L_{n+1}-j} z^j,$$

so that  $(*)$  asserts

$$\sum_{j=0}^{L_{n+1}} \frac{1}{j!} z^j C_{L_{n+1}-j} = \sum_{j=L_{n+1}-L_n}^{L_{n+1}} \frac{1}{j!} z^j C_{L_{n+1}-j} + h_{n+1}(z).$$

In the range  $L_{n+1} - L_n \leq j \leq L_{n+1}$ , the coefficients of the  $z^j$  are automatically correct. For the range  $0 \leq j < L_{n+1} - L_n$  we can choose the  $C_{L_{n+1}-j}$

to make (\*) correct. We note that this is equivalent to choosing  $C_l$  for  $L_n + 1 \leq l \leq L_{n+1}$ . This completes the construction.

To verify that  $(Q_k)$  is dense, let  $E$  be an entire function,  $N > 0$  and  $\varepsilon > 0$ . Choose  $n$  so that

$$\text{i) } n > N,$$

$$\text{ii) } |h_n(z) - E(z)| \leq \frac{1}{3} \varepsilon \quad \text{for } |z| \leq N,$$

$$\text{iii) } \frac{1}{n} \leq \frac{1}{3} \varepsilon, \quad \text{and}$$

$$\text{iv) } |(I^{L_n} f)(z)| \leq \frac{1}{3} \varepsilon \quad \text{for } |z| \leq N.$$

$$\text{Then } |Q_{L_n}(z) - E(z)| \leq \varepsilon \quad \text{for all } |z| \leq N.$$

We conclude with a result communicated to us by I. N. Baker, namely that there is no entire function  $f$  such that the sequence of its compositional iterates  $f^{[n]}$  spans a dense set. If  $f$  is linear, then the closed span of its iterates contains only linear functions. (That is, the only univalent entire functions are the linear ones. See [BUR], §11.19, p. 370 and the Notes on p. 407 for several proofs.) If  $f$  is not linear, then there exist  $z_1, z_2$  with  $z_1 \neq z_2$  but  $f(z_1) = f(z_2)$ . This equality also holds for all linear combinations of iterates, so the closed span of the iterates lies in the proper closed subspace  $\{g : g(z_1) = g(z_2)\}$ . Finally, we remark that if  $f$  is universal in sense (b) then the pair  $f(z), z - 1$  is universal under composition.

## REFERENCES

- [BIR] BIRKHOFF, G. D. Démonstration d'un théorème élémentaire sur les fonctions entières. *C. R. Acad. Sci. Paris* 189 (1929), 473-475.
- [BLR] BLAIR, Charles and Lee RUBEL. A universal entire function. *Amer. Math. Monthly* 90 (1983), 331-332—see also Addendum, to appear December 1983.
- [BUR] BURCKEL, Robert G. *An Introduction to Classical Complex Analysis*. Vol. I, Academic Press, New York and San Francisco, 1979.
- [GRM] MACLANE, Gerald. Sequences of derivatives and normal families. *J. d'Analyse Math.* 2 (1952), 72-87.
- [LUH, I] LUH, Wolfgang. On universal functions. *Fourier Analysis and Approximation Theory* (Proc. Colloq. Budapest, 1976), Vol. II, 503-511, Colloq. Math. Soc. Janos Bolyai, 19, North-Holland, Amsterdam 1978.
- [LUH, II] ———. Universalfunktionen in einfach zusammenhängenden Gebieten. *Aequationes Math.* 19 (1979), 183-193.

- [SAZ] SAKS, S. and A. ZYMUND. *Analytic functions*. 2nd ed., Polish Scientific Publishers 1965.
- [SEW] SEIDEL, W. P. and J. L. WALSH. On approximation by Euclidean and non-Euclidean translates of an analytic function. *Bull. Amer. Math. Soc.* 47 (1941), 916-920.

(Reçu le 4 octobre 1983)

Charles Blair

Department of Business Administration  
University of Illinois  
Urbana, Illinois 61801

Lee Rubel

Department of Mathematics  
University of Illinois  
Urbana, Illinois 61801