

# **General solutions to the problem of radiogenic Argon-40 loss from metamorphic minerals : a comment**

Autor(en): **Wilson, Michael R.**

Objekttyp: **Article**

Zeitschrift: **Eclogae Geologicae Helvetiae**

Band (Jahr): **64 (1971)**

Heft 2

PDF erstellt am: **15.05.2024**

Persistenter Link: <https://doi.org/10.5169/seals-163987>

## **Nutzungsbedingungen**

Die ETH-Bibliothek ist Anbieterin der digitalisierten Zeitschriften. Sie besitzt keine Urheberrechte an den Inhalten der Zeitschriften. Die Rechte liegen in der Regel bei den Herausgebern.

Die auf der Plattform e-periodica veröffentlichten Dokumente stehen für nicht-kommerzielle Zwecke in Lehre und Forschung sowie für die private Nutzung frei zur Verfügung. Einzelne Dateien oder Ausdrucke aus diesem Angebot können zusammen mit diesen Nutzungsbedingungen und den korrekten Herkunftsbezeichnungen weitergegeben werden.

Das Veröffentlichen von Bildern in Print- und Online-Publikationen ist nur mit vorheriger Genehmigung der Rechteinhaber erlaubt. Die systematische Speicherung von Teilen des elektronischen Angebots auf anderen Servern bedarf ebenfalls des schriftlichen Einverständnisses der Rechteinhaber.

## **Haftungsausschluss**

Alle Angaben erfolgen ohne Gewähr für Vollständigkeit oder Richtigkeit. Es wird keine Haftung übernommen für Schäden durch die Verwendung von Informationen aus diesem Online-Angebot oder durch das Fehlen von Informationen. Dies gilt auch für Inhalte Dritter, die über dieses Angebot zugänglich sind.

Ein Dienst der *ETH-Bibliothek*

ETH Zürich, Rämistrasse 101, 8092 Zürich, Schweiz, [www.library.ethz.ch](http://www.library.ethz.ch)

## Graphical Solutions to the Problem of Radiogenic Argon-40 Loss from Metamorphic Minerals, a Comment

By MICHAEL R. WILSON

Laboratory for Isotope Geology, De Boelelaan 1085, Amsterdam 11

In a recent paper C. T. HARPER (1970) suggests a method of plotting potassium-argon data which might reduce the commonly observed discordance between potassium-argon dates from metamorphic micas and the true time of crystallisation as derived by other means. The method involves plotting argon-40 content against potassium-40 content. In an ideal closed-system case, samples of the same age but with different potassium contents will plot along a line (or isochron) which passes through the origin and whose slope is proportional to the age of the samples. If it is supposed that all samples, whatever their potassium content, have lost an identical volume of radiogenic argon then their analyses plot along a line parallel to the closed-system isochron, but with a negative intercept on the argon-40 ordinate. This intercept indicates the volume of argon-40 lost. Such is HARPER's graphical solution. It is questionable whether such a simple hypothesis could apply to natural rock systems since it does not take into account variations in argon retentivity caused by differences in grain size and chemical composition, but such is not the purpose of this communication.

HARPER seeks to gain support for his hypothesis by citing examples from the Scottish and Irish Caledonides and from the northern Appalachians. He admits that "the scatter of data is in some cases more than desirable", but suggests that "the results do illustrate the feasibility of using isochron-type plots for K<sup>40</sup>-Ar<sup>40</sup> data presentation".

Unfortunately the plots presented in Figures 6, 7 and 8 are far from convincing when the reference isochrons are removed from the diagrams. A single straight line can be drawn through, or close to, all the points in Figure 7, going through the origin. No criteria are proposed for selecting which biotites and muscovites in this figure should belong to which isochron.

Figure 5, on the other hand, is a very plausible plot, with whole-rock analyses of slates and phyllites lying on a 503 m.y. isochron with zero intercept, and analyses of micas lying on a parallel isochron with a negative intercept. Hypothesis proved? Not so. Figures 5 and 6 are both from the Scottish Caledonides. HARPER states unequivocally (p. 132) that the two groups of micas "appear indistinguishable on the basis of either stratigraphic, structural or geographic criteria". When all mica analyses in Figures 5 and 6 are plotted on one diagram (as can be done easily

using tracing paper) they form a single group of points, with sufficient scatter to make it quite uncertain as to whether the best fit line would have a positive or negative intercept. There is no suggestion from the distribution of points that the micas from Figure 5 should be plotted separately from those of Figure 6.

It would appear that the ten mica analyses in Figure 5 have been selected merely to fit the theory and for no geological or geochronological reason. Figure 5 must thus be rejected. The remaining data gives little support to the hypothesis.

#### REFERENCE

- HARPER, C. T. (1970): *Graphical Solutions to the Problem of Radiogenic Argon-40 Loss from Metamorphic Minerals*. Eclogae geol. Helv. 63/1, 119–140.