

**Zeitschrift:** Elemente der Mathematik  
**Herausgeber:** Schweizerische Mathematische Gesellschaft  
**Band:** 73 (2018)  
**Heft:** 1

**Artikel:** An algorithm for nontransitive partitions  
**Autor:** Brawer, Robert  
**DOI:** <https://doi.org/10.5169/seals-760277>

### **Nutzungsbedingungen**

Die ETH-Bibliothek ist die Anbieterin der digitalisierten Zeitschriften auf E-Periodica. Sie besitzt keine Urheberrechte an den Zeitschriften und ist nicht verantwortlich für deren Inhalte. Die Rechte liegen in der Regel bei den Herausgebern beziehungsweise den externen Rechteinhabern. Das Veröffentlichen von Bildern in Print- und Online-Publikationen sowie auf Social Media-Kanälen oder Webseiten ist nur mit vorheriger Genehmigung der Rechteinhaber erlaubt. [Mehr erfahren](#)

### **Conditions d'utilisation**

L'ETH Library est le fournisseur des revues numérisées. Elle ne détient aucun droit d'auteur sur les revues et n'est pas responsable de leur contenu. En règle générale, les droits sont détenus par les éditeurs ou les détenteurs de droits externes. La reproduction d'images dans des publications imprimées ou en ligne ainsi que sur des canaux de médias sociaux ou des sites web n'est autorisée qu'avec l'accord préalable des détenteurs des droits. [En savoir plus](#)

### **Terms of use**

The ETH Library is the provider of the digitised journals. It does not own any copyrights to the journals and is not responsible for their content. The rights usually lie with the publishers or the external rights holders. Publishing images in print and online publications, as well as on social media channels or websites, is only permitted with the prior consent of the rights holders. [Find out more](#)

**Download PDF:** 04.03.2026

**ETH-Bibliothek Zürich, E-Periodica, <https://www.e-periodica.ch>**

---

---

## Short note    An algorithm for nontransitive partitions

---

---

Robert Brawer

**Abstract.** One of the most famous nontransitive games is given by the Efron dice, invented by the American statistician Bradley Efron. It consists of a set of four dice  $A, B, C, D$  which are labeled such that, in the long run,  $A$  beats  $B$ ,  $B$  beats  $C$ ,  $C$  beats  $D$ , and  $D$  beats  $A$ . In this paper, we present a new algorithm for a partition of the first  $(2n + 1)^2$  natural numbers in equally spaced parts such that the sums of the parts are equal and such that a nontransitive loop of equal probabilities arises. By this we find a method for the construction of what we call Efron partitions. Finally a labeling for five nontransitive icosahedrons is given.

### 1 Introduction

The Efron dice are well known as an example of the nontransitivity of probabilities [1]. In order to get a set of only three nontransitive dice we number the faces of three Laplace dice:  $A$  by 1, 1, 6, 6, 8, 8,  $B$  by 3, 3, 5, 5, 7, 7 and the faces of die  $C$  by 2, 2, 4, 4, 9, 9. A quick calculation shows:  $P(A \rightarrow B) = P(B \rightarrow C) = P(C \rightarrow A) = \frac{5}{9}$ , where  $P(A \rightarrow B)$  stands for the probability that die  $A$  wins against die  $B$ . Furthermore the sums of the numbers on each die are equal. Is there a suchlike nontransitive labeling for icosahedrons, or more generally for  $n$ -faced dice?

H. Steinhaus and S. Trybula [2], as well as R.P. Savage [3], showed how to get a nontransitive loop of probabilities for three  $n$ -faced dice, when the sums of the numbers on each die do not have to be equal.

### 2 An algorithm for nontransitive partition

**Definition 1.** A basic nontransitive partition of the set  $S_n = \{1, 2, \dots, n^2\}$ ,  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ , is a equally spaced partition  $\{X_i\}$ ,  $i = 1, \dots, n$ , in which every part has the same sum together with a Laplace probability  $P$  with a nontransitivity condition:

1.  $|X_i| = |X_j|$ ,  $i, j = 1, \dots, n$
2.  $\sum_{a \in X_i} a = \sum_{a \in X_j} a$
3.  $P(X_{i+1} \rightarrow X_i) = P(X_1 \rightarrow X_n) > \frac{1}{2}$ ,  $i = 1, \dots, n - 1$ ,  
$$P(X_i \rightarrow X_j) = \frac{|\{x_k | x_k > x_m, x_k \in X_i, x_m \in X_j\}|}{(n)^2}, i, j = 1, \dots, n.$$

**Theorem 2.** *The algorithm below produces a basic nontransitive partition of the set  $S_{2n+1}$ ,  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ , with  $P(X_{i+1} \rightarrow X_i) = P(X_1 \rightarrow X_{2n+1}) = \frac{2n^2+3n}{(2n+1)^2}$ ,  $i = 1, \dots, 2n$ .*

**Algorithm.** We explain the procedure of the algorithm by partitioning  $S_7$ . We start on the left-hand bottom of a  $7 \times 7$  grid filling in upwards the natural numbers in the first column. If this is done we go to the element one row below and in the column just one step to the right. Again we fill upwards the second column, thinking the horizontal edges of the grid glued together. And so on until the grid is filled up.

$X_7$	$7 \searrow$	9	18	27	$29 \uparrow$	38	47
$X_6$	6	$8 \uparrow$	17	26	$35 \searrow$	37	46
$X_5$	5	$14 \searrow$	16	25	34	$36 \uparrow$	45
$X_4$	4	13	$15 \uparrow$	24	33	$42 \searrow$	44
$X_3$	3	12	$21 \searrow$	23	32	41	$43 \uparrow$
$X_2$	2	11	20	$22 \uparrow$	31	40	49
$X_1$	$1 \uparrow$	10	19	$28 \searrow$	30	39	48
	$C_1$	$C_2$	$C_3$	$C_4$	$C_5$	$C_6$	$C_7$

Due to the filling procedure each number in column  $C_j$  is greater than each number in column  $C_i$ , for  $j > i$ . In comparing row  $X_{i+1}$  to row  $X_i$ ,  $i = 1, \dots, 2n$ , and  $X_1$  to  $X_{2n+1}$  we see that there are  $2n$  numbers bigger by 1 than the number just below, but where the smallest and the biggest number in a column meet the difference is  $-2n$ , so the sum in each row must be equal. By the arguments above  $X_{i+1}$  wins against  $X_i$ ,  $i = 1, \dots, 2n$ , and  $X_1$  wins against  $X_{2n+1}$ , in  $(2n+1) + 2n + (2n-1) + \dots + 2 + 1 - 1 = 2n^2 + 3n$  cases out of  $(2n+1)^2$ . The minus one in the forthcoming addition corrects the count where the smallest and the biggest number in a column meet. So  $P(X_{i+1} \rightarrow X_i) = P(X_1 \rightarrow X_{2n+1}) = \frac{2n^2+3n}{(2n+1)^2}$ ,  $i = 1, \dots, 2n$ .

### 3 A nontransitive partition for five icosahedrons and some Efron partitions

Let  $L = [\dots, \dots, \dots](k)$  be a list in which every entry appears exactly  $k$ -times.

**Definition 3.** A nontransitive partition of a list  $\mathcal{L}_n = [1, 2, \dots, n^2](k)$ ,  $n, k \in \mathbb{N}$ , is a equally spaced partition  $\{L_i\}$ ,  $i = 1, \dots, n$ , in which every part has the same sum together with a Laplace probability  $P$  with a nontransitivity condition such that 1., 2. and 3. of Definition 1 hold.

We call such a list  $\mathcal{L}_n$  together with a nontransitive partition  $\{L_i\}$ ,  $i = 1, \dots, n$ , a  $(n^2, k)$ -Efron partition.

The nontransitive partitions of the sets  $S_{2n+1}$  in Theorem 2.2 are all  $((2n + 1)^2, 1)$ -Efron partitions. The well-known example in the introduction is a  $(3^2, 2)$ -Efron partition.

**Example.** An icosahedron has  $20 = 5 \cdot 4$  faces. We produce with our algorithm a basic nontransitive partition of the set  $S_5$ . Then we simply quadruple each number in every part to get a nontransitive partition with 100 numbers for the faces of 5 icosahedrons. This results in the partition:

$$\begin{aligned} L_1 &= [1, 8, 15, 17, 24](4), \\ L_2 &= [2, 9, 11, 18, 25](4), \\ L_3 &= [3, 10, 12, 19, 21](4), \\ L_4 &= [4, 6, 13, 20, 22](4), \\ L_5 &= [5, 7, 14, 16, 23](4). \end{aligned}$$

With  $P(L_{i+1} \rightarrow L_i) = P(L_1 \rightarrow L_5) = \frac{14}{25}, i = 1 \dots 4$ .

We have just constructed a  $((2n + 1)^2, 4)$ -Efron partition for  $n = 2$ . By an analogous argument we get more generally:

**Theorem 4.** *If  $m = (2n + 1)^2 \cdot k, n, k \in \mathbb{N}$ , then we can construct a  $((2n + 1)^2, k)$ -Efron partition with  $P(L_{i+1} \rightarrow L_i) = P(L_1 \rightarrow L_{2n+1}) = \frac{2n^2+3n}{(2n+1)^2}, i = 1, \dots, 2n$ .*

## References

- [1] Martin Gardner, *The Colossal Book of Mathematics*, 1st ed. New York: W.W. Norton and Company, 2001, 286–311.
- [2] Hugo Steinhaus and Stanisław Trybuła, *On a paradox in applied probabilities*, Bull. Acad. Polon. Sci. 7, 1959, 67–69.
- [3] Richard P. Savage, Jr., *The paradox of non transitive dice*, Amer. Math. Monthly 101, 1994, 429–436.

Robert Brawer  
 Amanz-Gressly-Strasse 33  
 CH-4500 Solothurn  
 e-mail: robert.brawer@bluewin.ch